

### Scoring Criteria for Options Appraisal and Consolidated Scores

Criterion	Score (max. total 150)
<b>1. Customers</b> Opportunity to improve services and the customer experience	<b>30</b>
<b>2. Strategic alignment</b> Ability to deliver the Council's strategic priorities for culture in respect of tourism, education, creative excellence and investing in cultural infrastructure	<b>30</b>
<b>3. Financial savings and wider efficiencies</b> 3a Ability to deliver required £150,000 recurring saving within the required timescale (1 April 2019) 3b Ability to generate increased income and deliver wider financial/other efficiencies by 2020/21	<b>15</b>  <b>15</b> <b>TOTAL 30</b>
<b>4. Sustainability</b> 4a Long-term viability of the proposed option 4b Ability to maintain business continuity during implementation	<b>20</b> <b>10</b> <b>TOTAL 30</b>
<b>5. Acceptability</b> 5a Acceptability of change to current ALEO funders 5b Acceptability of change to current ALEO Boards	<b>15</b> <b>15</b> <b>TOTAL 30</b>
<b>TOTAL MAXIMUM SCORE</b>	<b>150</b>

### Scoring Scale

33% - Poor below requirements

50% - Below expectations but meets some requirements

67% - Meets requirements

83% - Exceeds requirements and adds some value in areas

100% - Exceeds requirements and adds some value in most areas

Criteria	Option 1: Status quo/no change from 2 sole member company ALEOs	Option 2: Single Culture Trust – sole member company	Option 3: Single Culture Trust – fully independent from the Council	Option 4: Single Culture Trust – SCIO/other constitutional status	Option 5: Hybrid delivery model – Trust plus Council in-house delivery plus community-led delivery	Option 6: Two Trusts – fully independent from the Council
Criteria 1 (maximum score: 30)	17.8	22.8	15.2	16.8	13	12.9
Criteria 2 (maximum score: 30)	18.5	22.5	14.5	17.1	15.7	13.6
Criteria 3a (maximum score: 15)	9.35	7.6	4.5	5.95	5.25	6.5
Criteria 3b (maximum score: 15)	8.15	10.25	6.35	8	6.35	6.35
Criteria 4a (maximum score: 20)	10.25	11.44	8.5	8.42	7.92	7.5
Criteria 4b (maximum score: 10)	8.97	6.94	4.16	4.26	3.93	4.83
Criteria 5a (maximum score: 15)	11.65	9.75	7.7	7.45	6.2	7.6
Criteria 5b (maximum score: 15)	12.45	7.2	5.85	6.7	6.5	7.65
<b>TOTAL SCORES</b>	<b>97.12</b>	<b>98.48</b>	<b>66.76</b>	<b>74.68</b>	<b>64.85</b>	<b>66.93</b>