PERTH AND KINROSS COUNCIL

25 September 2019

REVIEW OF SCHOOL CATERING SERVICES

Report by Executive Director (Education and Children's Services) (Report No. 19/278)

PURPOSE OF REPORT

This report outlines the potential alternative delivery models for the provision of Primary School and Early Learning and Childcare (ELC) meal provision and compares those models against the Tay Cuisine (Central Production Unit (CPU) based in Dundee) as set out in Model 1 within the report.

Model 1 was previously agreed, in principle, by the Lifelong Learning Committee on 30 January 2019 (Report No. 19/34 refers). Through the Council budget process, a saving of £200k from a review of catering services was approved in February 2016. A further £226k (giving a total of £426k) was approved by Council in February 2019 based on the development of a centralised CPU serving the Tayside area. The approved savings were based on Model 1 assumptions with the adaptation and expansion of the existing Tayside Contracts Tay Cuisine facility in Dundee.

1. BACKGROUND

- 1.1 Perth & Kinross Council is part of a joint collaborative initiative in relation to Education and Children's Services with both Angus and Dundee Councils and NHS Tayside. A common report titled "Strategic Collaboration and Enhanced Partnership Working (Angus, Dundee and Perth and Kinross Councils Education and Children's Services)" (Report No. 16/563 refers) was approved in December 2016 by the respective Councils and NHS Board. This report set out the potential for extended collaborative approaches between the above named organisations together with the Third Sector and private enterprise as appropriate.
- 1.2 The development of a CPU in partnership with Angus Council, Dundee City Council and Tayside Contracts provided an opportunity to enhance that collaborative approach and to meet the approved savings of £200k approved by Council on <u>11 February 2016</u>. Approval was given by Lifelong Learning Committee (LLC) on 30 January 2019 (<u>Report No. 19/34 refers</u>) to continue to work in partnership with Angus and Dundee City Councils and Tayside Contracts to plan for the implementation of a cook-freeze centralised meals production facility.
- 1.3 Through the budget process, additional savings of £226k were identified for 2021/22 by adopting a CPU model based in Dundee which was accepted and approved by Council on <u>20 February 2019</u>. The total approved saving which

requires to be met by this Council and which is currently aligned with the delivery of a Dundee based CPU, is £426k. It was recognised that the Council would also benefit from an additional £33k unbudgeted surplus which would be returned to Perth & Kinross Council from Tayside Contracts, as part of that proposed service delivery model (Model 1).

- 1.4 A number of factors influenced the development of a collaborative solution to achieve the savings target:
 - All three Councils face significant challenges to meet the demand for meal provision as a consequence of the implementation of P1-P3 free meals in 2015 (340,000 additional meals in Perth & Kinross) and the statutory expansion of ELC service provision by August 2020. For Perth & Kinross Council, this amounts to an additional 400,000 ELC meals per annum;
 - Currently, Perth & Kinross Council does not have adequate kitchen infrastructure to meet the increase in demand for meal provision as a result of ELC expansion without some further investment and operational reorganisation;
 - Tayside Contracts, a body jointly owned by the three Councils, currently provides approximately 5.8 million school meals per year and already have a functional kitchen based in Dundee (Tay Cuisine is the current cook fresh community meals kitchen) which could be expanded and adapted to provide an appropriate delivery model to meet the collective increased demand for meal provision across the three Councils; and
 - Given the savings requirement, a Tayside wide CPU was assessed as providing the most cost effective, efficient and future proofed model to both provide an appropriate service to meet the increasing demand and to deliver the required savings.
- 1.5 The savings aligned to the delivery of Model 1 have been approved through the Council's budget setting process.
- 1.6 Since the time of LLC in January 2019, concerns have been expressed by a number of Elected Members regarding the workforce implications of adopting a model which has the CPU based in Dundee. Officers were asked to outline alternative options available and, in particular, to explore the feasibility of locating the CPU in Perth.
- 1.7 The following section of the report outlines various potential service delivery models for Council to consider against the original recommendation as set out in Model 1 below.

2. SERVICE DELIVERY MODELS

2.1 **Model 1: CPU at Tay Cuisine in Dundee delivering Primary School and ELC meals to the Tayside School Estate** (including Dundee City Council community meals).

- 2.1.1 This proposed model would require the existing Tay Cuisine building, based in Dundee, to be expanded and adapted to convert it into a cook-freeze facility to provide Primary School and ELC meals across the three Councils.
- 2.1.2 Key features of this model are:

Benefits/Pros

- Enables Perth and Kinross Council to deliver the required approved recurring revenue savings of £426k, plus a further unbudgeted £33k surplus returned to the Council from Tayside Contracts;
- Provides economies of scale delivering maximum financial savings to Perth and Kinross Council through collaborative working;
- Dundee City Council and Angus Council, as part of the wider collaborative agenda, have already committed to investing in the Tay Cuisine based in Dundee and serving the Tayside School Estate;
- Creates the capacity to meet increased demand for ELC meal provision by August 2020 which is the statutory implementation date for increasing funded ELC hours to 1140 per annum;
- Staffing and service arrangements in all 29 dining centres in Perth and Kinross schools will not change;
- Enhanced food safety through 'positive release' testing (ie results available from testing prior to food being consumed – this can only be achieved with a cook-freeze service);
- Reduced environmental impact is achieved through the offset of additional daily distribution of meals by car/van/taxi against a higher number of supplier deliveries by lorry. Also, energy consumption of cooking and regenerating meals will be reduced by centralisation of production; and
- Potential capacity for further expansion of the facility if other market opportunities present or policy/legislative changes require increased volume in meal provision.

Risks/Cons

- Converting the existing building to a cook-freeze CPU requires a shared capital investment of £1.9m (shared between the three Councils, plus circa £100k per Council for infrastructure to support the CPU model in the School Estate);
- Reduction of 9 posts in the Tayside Contracts workforce currently located in Perth and Kinross school settings. It should be noted however, that employee turnover rates give assurance that this could be managed without the need for compulsory redundancies;

- As the current workforce is predominantly female and part-time, there will be a workforce impact to be considered in relation to the introduction of some lower graded posts within the revised establishment. This may be mitigated to an extent with the offer of additional hours; and
- No immediate potential to create additional Tayside Contract job opportunities within Perth and Kinross.
- 2.2 **Model 2: CPU at Tay Cuisine in Dundee with increased number of Onsite hubs in PKC School Estate** (including Dundee City Council Community Meals).
- 2.2.1 This option provides the same model described in 2.1 above, but with an increased number of On-site hubs with a resultant decrease in the requirement for Mini-hubs, thereby negating the loss of 9 jobs.

Hub definitions:

On-Site Hub – These are units with sufficient capacity for storage and regeneration of meals for their own site. They will receive frozen elements of the meal from the CPU, which are regenerated and supplemented by additional items delivered direct from suppliers, which will then be stored and prepared onsite ready for service.

Mini-Hub – They will receive pre-heated elements of the meal from their Distribution Hub. These will be supplemented by deliveries direct from suppliers which will then be stored and prepared onsite ready for service.

Distribution Hub – These are units with sufficient capacity for storage and regeneration of meals for their own site. They will operate in the same way as the on-site hubs, the only difference is that these units will regenerate food from the CPU for Mini-hubs and Dining Centres also.

Dining Centre – These will be fully reliant on their Distribution Hub for all elements of the school lunch which will be delivered from their Distribution Hub ready for service.

2.2.2 Key features of this model are:

Benefits/Pros

- Negates net loss of 9 Tayside Contracts posts in Perth and Kinross;
- Provides economies of scale delivering maximum financial savings to Perth and Kinross Council through collaborative working;
- Dundee City Council and Angus Council, as part of the wider collaborative agenda, have already committed to investing in the Tay Cuisine based in Dundee and serving the Tayside School Estate;

- Creates the capacity to meet increased demand for ELC meal provision by August 2020 which is the statutory implementation date for increasing funded ELC hours to 1140 per annum;
- Staffing and service arrangements in all 29 dining centres in Perth and Kinross schools will not change;
- Enhanced food safety through 'positive release' testing (ie results available from testing prior to food being consumed – this can only be achieved with a cook-freeze service);
- Reduced environmental impact is achieved through the offset of additional daily distribution of meals by car/van/taxi against a higher number of supplier deliveries by lorry. Also, energy consumption of cooking and regenerating meals will be significantly reduced by centralisation of production; and
- Potential capacity for further expansion of the facility if other market opportunities present or policy/legislative changes require increased volume in meal provision.

Risks/Cons

- The increased labour costs of maintaining the 9 jobs associated with this model when compared to Model 1, would leave a shortfall in annual recurring savings of approximately £94k;
- Council would require to identify recurring alternative savings amounting to £94k to offset the shortfall in delivering the full approved savings;
- Converting the existing building to a cook-freeze CPU requires a shared capital investment of £1.9m (shared between the three Councils, plus circa £100k per Council for infrastructure to support the CPU model in the School Estate);
- As the current workforce is predominantly female and part-time, there will be a workforce impact to be considered in relation to the introductions of some lower graded posts within the revised establishment. This may be mitigated to an extent with the offer of additional hours; and
- No immediate potential to create additional Tayside Contract job opportunities within Perth and Kinross.

2.3 Model 3: CPU in Perth and Kinross delivering Primary School and ELC meals to the Tayside School Estate.

2.3.1 This model provides indicative desktop costs for the development of a Perth based CPU to supply Primary School and ELC meals Tayside wide. There are two, currently available, Council owned sites in Perth identified as an alternative to the refurbishment of the existing Tay Cuisine which underpins Models 1 and 2 above.

- 2.3.2 All of the benefits/risks identified are based on the assumption that Dundee City Council and Angus Council, as part of the wider collaborative agenda, would support the development of a CPU based in Perth. Given their commitment to the expansion of the Tay Cuisine facility, neither Council would collaborate on this alternative model on the basis of the increased cost implications and inability to deliver adequate ELC meal provision by August 2020 (being the statutory implementation date for increasing funded ELC hours to 1140 hours per annum).
- 2.3.3 Key features of this model are:

Benefits/Pros

- The potential 32 posts associated with the establishment of the Tayside CPU would be based in Perth (net increase of 23 new jobs overall in Perth and Kinross);
- Staffing and service arrangements in all 29 dining centres in Perth and Kinross schools will not change;
- Enhanced food safety through 'positive release' testing (ie results available from testing prior to food being consumed – this can only be achieved with a cook-freeze service);
- Reduced environmental impact is achieved through the offset of additional daily distribution of meals by car/van/taxi against a higher number of supplier deliveries by lorry. Also, energy consumption of cooking and regenerating meals will be significantly reduced by centralisation of production;
- In time (estimated August 2022), it would create the capacity to meet increased demand for ELC meal provision across Tayside; and
- Depending upon the design adopted, there is the potential capacity for further expansion of the facility if other market opportunities present or policy/legislative changes require increased volume in meal provision.

Risks/Cons

- Requires significantly more capital investment (total shared investment of approximately £4.8m);
- There would be no capacity to meet the increased demand for ELC meal provision across Tayside by August 2020 (which is the statutory implementation date for increasing funded ELC hours to 1140 per annum);
- Reduction in annual revenue savings to Perth & Kinross Council of approximately £68k once implemented;

- Reduction of 9 posts in the Tayside Contracts workforce currently located in Perth and Kinross school settings. It should be noted however, that employee turnover rates give assurance that this could be managed without the need for compulsory redundancies;
- As the current workforce is predominantly female and part-time, there will be a workforce impact to be considered in relation to the introduction of some lower graded posts within the revised establishment. This may be mitigated to an extent with the offer of additional hours; and
- Increased capital costs extend project payback period and loan charges.

2.4 Model 4: Development of Perth based CPU delivering Primary School and ELC meals to Perth and Kinross Council area only.

- 2.4.1 This model requires a new build CPU in Perth. There are two, currently available, Council owned sites in Perth identified as an alternative to the refurbishment of the existing Tay Cuisine which underpins Models 1 and 2 above.
- 2.4.2 As Angus and Dundee City Councils are committed to the Model 1 Option on the basis of cost and the requirement to meet increased demand for meal provision by August 2020, the effect of implementing this model would be the creation of two stand-alone CPUs (one in Dundee and one in Perth).
- 2.4.3 Key features of this model are:

Benefits/Pros

- In time (estimated August 2022), it would create the capacity for increased meal numbers resulting from ELC expansion;
- Potential to create 23 additional Tayside Contracts job opportunities in the Perth CPU (net increase of 14 new jobs overall in Perth and Kinross);
- Staffing and service arrangements in all 29 dining centres in Perth and Kinross schools will not change;
- Enhanced food safety through *'positive release'* testing (ie results available from testing prior to food being consumed this can only be achieved with a cook-freeze service);
- Reduced environmental impact (but less than the previous models) is achieved through the offset of additional daily distribution of meals by car/van/taxi against a higher number of supplier deliveries by lorry. Also, energy consumption of cooking and regenerating meals will be significantly reduced by centralisation of production; and
- Potential capacity for further expansion of the facility if other market opportunities present or policy/legislative changes require increased volume in meal provision.

Risks/Cons

- The build and land project costs associated with a new build CPU in Perth would be approximately £4m (£140k per annum borrowing costs over 50 years based on current estimate of £35k per annum per £1m borrowed using the current consolidated loans fund rate);
- The approved savings of £426k would not be met, including the additional £33k unbudgeted surplus returned to the Council from Tayside Contracts;
- Council would require to identify recurring alternative savings amounting to £426k to offset the fact that this model would not deliver the approved savings;
- The Perth CPU would not be operational in time to deliver ELC meals from August 2020 (timescale for readiness for this model is around August 2022);
- Increased costs associated with developing and operating two CPUs rather than one;
- Reduction of 9 posts in the Tayside Contracts workforce currently located in Perth and Kinross school settings. It should be noted however, that employee turnover rates give assurance that this could be managed without the need for compulsory redundancies; and
- As the current workforce is predominantly female and part-time, there will be a workforce impact to be considered in relation to the introductions of some lower graded posts within the revised establishment. This may be mitigated to an extent with the offer of additional hours.

2.5 **Model 5: No CPU delivery for Perth and Kinross, develop existing** infrastructure and service delivery.

- 2.5.1 Current infrastructure within Perth and Kinross equates to 71 school based sites, of which 10 are currently operating at full/near full capacity, and therefore have little or no ability to meet increased demand. This model proposes approximately £25k capital investment to make alterations to some existing kitchen facilities plus the re-opening of 3 kitchens which are currently not operating to deliver the additional capacity required.
- 2.5.2 Key features of this model are:

Benefits/ Pros

- Creates the capacity to meet the increased demand for ELC meal provision by August 2020 which is the statutory implementation date for increasing funded ELC hours to 1140 per annum;
- Requires capital investment of approximately £25k compared with the other models; and

• Potential to create 41 new Tayside Contracts job opportunities within Perth and Kinross.

Risks/Cons

- The approved savings of £426k are not deliverable, including the additional £33k unbudgeted surplus returned to the Council from Tayside Contracts;
- Council would require to identify recurring alternative savings amounting to £426k;
- Any economies of scale associated with increased meal volumes are negated by increased labour and transport costs, less efficient productivity and increased overhead costs associated with Tayside Contracts;
- There may be a challenge in recruiting the necessary part-time, term-time personnel by August 2020;
- Reconfiguring service arrangements for those kitchens already operating at or near full capacity will be challenging and will require additional offsite provision for up to 10 schools and re-opening of 3 closed kitchens;
- Business continuity risk (ie running so many kitchens at full capacity would leave very little spare capacity for contingency requirements);
- Does not future proof the service for potential service expansion, market opportunity, policy change and limits potential for further efficiencies or savings; and
- Running a cook freeze catering service for Dundee City and Angus Councils, and a cook fresh service for Perth and Kinross Council, will necessitate the creation of two catering services, each with their own associated management systems and overheads.

3. CURRENT POSITION

- 3.1 Given the pressing need to ensure that the three Councils have capacity to meet the increased demand for ELC meal provision by August 2020, and the requirement to realise savings and efficiencies, both Dundee City and Angus Councils have committed to the Model 1 option, albeit in anticipation that Perth and Kinross Council would also collaborate in relation to this service delivery option.
- 3.2 Accordingly, work has been undertaken to date and the main contractor, Hub (East Central), has been appointed. A project brief has been developed by Tayside Contracts to ensure the contractor can expedite the required works without undue delay and the project can be delivered within the projected budget and within the necessary timescale to meet increased demand for ELC meal provision by August 2020.

- 3.3 The current project risks associated with the Model 1 proposal are included at Appendix 1 and these will be mitigated through appropriate project plan actions.
- 3.4 With respect to food procurement, Appendix 2 details the current usage of local foods within the school meals service. The CPU operation can be attractive to the local supply chain as it is a singular delivery point. Tayside Contracts will continue to pursue food procurement with a view to increasing local and seasonal options within available resources and the regulatory context around school food and nutrition.

4. CONCLUSION

- 4.1 A summary impact assessment and ranking of the 5 delivery models is attached at Appendix 3.
- 4.2 The assessment of the 5 models has identified Model 1 as being the most appropriate service delivery option in terms of delivering the approved savings and ensuring that the model for the delivery of Primary School and ELC meal provision has the potential capacity for further expansion of the facility if other market opportunities present or policy/legislative changes require increased volume in meal provision.
- 4.3 Model 1 has been assessed as being the most efficient from an operational management perspective and the model which delivers best value.
- 4.4 The adoption of any option other than Model 1 will require the identification of alternative recurring savings in the Council's Revenue Budget.

5. **RECOMMENDATIONS**

- 5.1 It is recommended that the Council:
 - Notes the assessment of the potential service delivery models for the provision of Primary School and ELC meal provision, given the increase in demand which will flow from the implementation of the statutory expansion of ELC to 1140 hours per annum by August 2020;
 - (ii) Notes the requirement to deliver annual recurring savings of £426k as approved by Council, as part of the budget process; and
 - (iii) Approves the collaborative option as set out in Model 1 (the development of a CPU based in Dundee and serving Perth and Kinross, Dundee City and Angus Councils) as the service delivery model for Primary School and ELC meal provision.

Aution(5)				
Name	Designation	Contact Details		
Simon Farrer	Catering and Facilities	ECSCommittee@pkc.gov.uk		
	Services Manager	01738 475000		
	5			

Author(s)

Approved Name	Designation	Date
Sheena Devlin	Executive Director	16 September 2019
	(Education and	-
	Children Services)	

If you or someone you know would like a copy of this document in another language or format, (on occasion, only a summary of the document will be provided in translation), this can be arranged by contacting the Customer Service Centre on 01738 475000. You can also send us a text message on 07824 498145.

All Council Services can offer a telephone translation facility.

1. IMPLICATIONS, ASSESSMENTS, CONSULTATION AND COMMUNICATION

Strategic Implications	Yes / None		
Community Plan / Single Outcome Agreement	Yes		
Corporate Plan	Yes		
Resource Implications			
Financial	Yes		
Workforce	Yes		
Asset Management (land, property, IST)	Yes		
Assessments			
Equality Impact Assessment	Yes		
Strategic Environmental Assessment	Yes		
Sustainability (community, economic, environmental)	None		
Legal and Governance	Yes		
Risk	Yes		
Consultation			
Internal	Yes		
External	Yes		
Communication			
Communications Plan	Yes		

1. Strategic Implications

Community Plan / Single Outcome Agreement

- 1.1 This section sets out how the proposals relate to the delivery of the Perth and Kinross Community Plan/Single Outcome Agreement in terms of the following priorities:
 - (i) Giving every child the best start in life
 - (ii) Developing educated, responsible and informed citizens
 - (iii) Promoting a prosperous, inclusive and sustainable economy
 - (iv) Supporting people to lead independent, healthy and active lives
 - (v) Creating a safe and sustainable place for future generations

This report relates to Objective No (iii).

Corporate Plan

- 1.2 This section sets out how the proposals relate to the achievement of the Council's Corporate Plan Objectives.
 - (I) Giving every child the best start in life;
 - (II) Developing educated, responsible and informed citizens;
 - (III) Promoting a prosperous, inclusive and sustainable economy;
 - (IV) Supporting people to lead independent, healthy and active lives; and
 - (V) Creating a safe and sustainable place for future generations.

This report relates to Objective No (i).

- 1.3 The report also links to the Education & Children's Services Policy Framework in respect of the following key policy area:
 - Maximising Resources

2. Resource Implications

<u>Financial</u>

2.1 The table below provides a summary overview of the costs associated with each model and Red Amber Green (RAG) status in terms of overall deliverability:

Note:

Model 1: CPU at Tay Cuisine in Dundee delivering Primary School and ELC meals to the Tayside School Estate Model 2: CPU at Tay Cuisine in Dundee with increased number of On-site hubs in PKC School Estate Model 3: CPU in Perth and Kinross delivering Primary School and ELC meals to Tayside School Estate Model 4: Development of two CPUs, one at Tay Cuisine and one in Perth area Model 5: No CPU delivery of Perth and Kinross, develop existing infrastructure and service delivery

Model	1	2	3	4	5
Annual Financial Savings	£459k	£365k	£391k	£0	£0
CPU Build costs	£1.9m	£1.9m	£4.8m	£4.0m	£0
Kitchen Alteration Costs	£100k	£100k+	£100k	£100k	£25k
Additional Transportation Costs	£144k	£143k	£144k	£159k ¹	£83k ²
Deliverable	Yes	Yes	No	In part ³	Yes
Service productivity (efficiency and					
capacity for future development)	Yes	Yes	Yes	In part	No

¹Includes lease charge of £15k per annum for additional temperature controlled vehicle

² Estimate – subject to final number of additional On-site hubs

³Could follow the adoption of option 5 for implementation from 2022

Staff implications are included below under Workforce

Workforce

- 2.2 Workforce overview:
 - (i) The introduction of the Tayside CPU in Dundee, along with an increase in the volume of meals due to the increase in ELC hours, will mean a net increase in total posts across Tayside of 36 posts. Within Perth and Kinross it is anticipated there will be an overall reduction of 9 posts based on the current school model.

(ii) Tayside Contracts does not envisage that there will be any compulsory redundancies. This will be achieved through natural employee turnover, voluntary redundancies and workforce planning which would ensure that only temporary employees were engaged in positions which would not be required in the longer term.

Model	1	2	3	4	5
Posts Lost	9	0	9	9	0
Posts Gained	0	0	32	23	41*
Net impact	-9	0	23	14	41*

(iii) The workforce impact is summarised across the 5 models as:

* Several schools will require to have additional ELC meals produced off-site where there is spare capacity.

Asset Management (land, property, IT)

2.3 Please refer to paragraph 2.1 above.

3. Assessments

Equality Impact Assessment

- 3.1 Under the Equality Act 2010, the Council is required to eliminate discrimination, advance equality of opportunity, and foster good relations between equality groups. Carrying out Equality Impact Assessments for plans and policies allows the Council to demonstrate that it is meeting these duties.
- 3.1.1 Tayside Contracts has completed an Equality Impact Assessment. Workforce impact (number of posts) has been included within the body of this report where possible. It isn't possible at this stage to ascertain what the gender and age profile impact of employees will be until workforce planning is implemented.

Strategic Environmental Assessment

- 3.2 The Environmental Assessment (Scotland) Act 2005 places a duty on the Council to identify and assess the environmental consequences of its proposals.
- 3.2.1 Links to environmental impact for each model as provided by Tayside Contracts have been included within Appendix 3.

<u>Sustainability</u>

3.3 Under the provisions of the Local Government in Scotland Act 2003 the Council has to discharge its duties in a way which contributes to the

achievement of sustainable development. In terms of the Climate Change Act, the Council has a general duty to demonstrate its commitment to sustainability and the community, environmental and economic impacts of its actions.

3.3.1 The information contained within this report has been considered under the Act. However, no action is required as the Act does not apply to the matters presented in this report.

3.4 Legal and Governance

The Head of Legal and Governance Services has been consulted in the preparation of this report.

3.5 N/A

<u>Risk</u>

3.6 Risk has been identified and mitigated within the report content.

4. Consultation

Internal

4.1 Head of Property Services, Head of Finance, Transformation Board, Corporate Equalities Team, Legal Services and ECS Finance and Governance Manager have been consulted in the preparation of this report.

<u>External</u>

4.2 Tayside Contracts, Dundee City and Angus Councils have been consulted in the preparation of this report.

5. Communication

5.1 A full communications plan will be developed.

2. BACKGROUND PAPERS

No background papers, as defined by Section 50D of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973 (other than any containing confidential or exempt information) were relied on to any material extent in preparing the above report.

3. APPENDICES

Appendix 1 – Project Risk Register Appendix 2 – Local Food Usage Appendix 3 – Delivery Model Summary